

Clean Heat Standard Technical Advisory Group
October 31, 2024 Meeting Minutes

Attendees

- Members of the Technical Advisory Group present
 - Alek Antczak, Vermont Department of Public Service
 - Matt Cota, Meadow Hill Consulting
 - Luce Hillman, University of Vermont
 - Emily Grubert, individual
 - Ken Jones, Individual
 - Michelle Keller, Fraktalas Energy
 - Casey Lamont, Burlington Electric Department
 - Sam Lehr, Molecule Group
 - Emily Levin, Northeast States Coordinated Air Use Management
 - Emily Roscoe, Efficiency Vermont
 - Jared Ulmer, Vermont Department of Health
 - Floyd Vergara, Clean Fuels Alliance America
 - Rick Weston, Individual
 - Patrick Wood, Ag Methane Advisors
 - Brian Woods, Vermont Agency of Natural Resources
- Facilitator
 - Catherine Morris, Consensus Building Institute
- Participating Vermont Public Utility Commission staff
 - Deirdre Morris

Welcome & Review of agenda [Time Stamp 0:00:00]

Review and approval of [10/17](#) and [10/24/24](#) minutes

[Ken Jones moved to approve the 10/17 meeting minutes. None opposed. Motion passed at 9:36 a.m.; Ken Jones moved to approve the 10/24 meeting minutes. Luce Hillman and Emily Levin abstained. None opposed. Motion passed at 9:36 a.m.]

Updates from the PUC [Time Stamp 0:10:24]

[Reminder that comments on the draft rule are due 11/1 (goes for the group and any individual TAG member wanting to submit comments); upcoming orders to expect from the PUC; OD timeline – postponed second draft to accommodate TAG deliberation on issues.]

PUC Draft Rule and Companion memo – Draft TAG comments [Time Stamp 0:18:30]

- Continued discussion of TAG comments (*shared in advance*)
- *Test TAG readiness to vote*

[See TAG memo in meeting materials and recording for discussion. After amending the memo, the group proceeded to a vote:

- *Supported the memo's comments: 10 votes*
- *Did not support the above comments: 1 vote (NOTE: Luce voted "No" re.# 1 above because she thought the TAG should consider the practicality of implementing the CHS and respond to PUC's statement, acknowledging that we haven't discussed this and could not meet tomorrow's deadline for comments.)*
- *Abstained: 2 votes (Brian and Jared)*

**Public comments included: concern about anonymous voting (TAG agreed to announce voting positions); an appreciation for the TAG feedback regarding review of consequences; a comment about the inappropriateness for TAG to challenge the PUC's "our work" statement in the status report.]*

Treatment of land use change in liquid biofuels' Cis (no changes from prior memo) [Time Stamp 0:58:40]

- Memo and **vote** on options for TAG statement

[See TAG memo in meeting materials and recording for discussion. After amending the memo, the group proceeded to a vote:

- *Option 1: Exclude LUCs initially (Opinion Dynamics' proposed approach), to be revisited through periodic reviews or when requested, pursuant to 8128(a)(3) and 8128(d): 9 votes*
- *Option 2: Include LUC: 2 votes (NOTE: Emily Grubert and Emily Levin said they could live with Option 1, although Option 2 is their preference)*
- *Abstain: 2 votes (Jared Ulmer and Emily Roscoe)]*

Break

Approach to determining wood fuel emission factors (shared if available) [Time Stamp 1:44:30]

- Proposed TAG comments
- *Test TAG readiness to vote*

[Group elected not to vote on this issue.]

Rate of Decline of Biofuel CIs (revised version shared in advance) [Time Stamp 2:16:28]

- Revised Memo and **vote** on options for TAG statement

[See TAG memo in meeting materials and recording for discussion. Group proceeded to a vote:]

- Option 1 – linear decline annually: 1 vote (NOTE: Patrick said he “could live with Option 3”)
- Option 2 – step down from 2030 to 2049: 2 votes (NOTE: both Floyd & Matt said they “could live with” Option 3)
- Option 3 – PUC to decide appropriate incremental decline: 8 votes
- Abstain: 2 votes (Emily R. and Jared)]

Definition of Advanced Wood Heat (revised version shared in advance)

- Revised memo and **vote** on options for TAG statement

[Group elected not to discuss this issue.]

Treatment of avoided methane in biofuels’ CIs (revised version shared in advance) [Time Stamp 2:26:15]

- Revised memo and **vote** on options for TAG statement

[See TAG memo in meeting materials and recording for discussion. Group proceeded to a vote:]

- Include avoided methane emissions: 7 votes
- Exclude avoided methane emissions: 5 votes (Michelle Keller, Emily Gruber, Emily Levin, Ken Jones, Brian Woods)
- Abstain: 2 votes (Jared Ulmer & Emily Roscoe)]

Public Health Considerations for CHS [Time Stamp 2:55:00]

- Next steps

[Next steps: Request to provide any additional references that could be used to supplement or fill gaps; asked for TAG guidance on limiting the scope of Public Health considerations to those fuels that are reasonably expected to be used in the near term; discussion to be continued at next TAG meeting.]

Agenda items for next TAG meeting [Time Stamp 3:00:00]

- Translating CIs to credit value
- Identifying measures that lower energy costs

[Added items: Report from Wood fuel and Advanced Wood Heat subgroup - vote on recommendations; Public Health considerations]

Close

Meeting adjourned at 12:39 p.m.

Meeting recording: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SjQo5pj-StY&list=PLm7FHMU9GY9R_zhQEp6UJf8imn92o7Srd&index=42&t=28s