

Clean Heat Standard Technical Advisory Group
April 4, 2024, DRAFT Meeting Minutes

Attendees

- Members of the Technical Advisory Group present
 - TJ Poor, Vermont Department of Public Service
 - Jared Ulmer, Vermont Department of Health
 - Matt Cota, Meadow Hill Consulting
 - Luce Hillman, University of Vermont
 - Ken Jones, Individual
 - Michelle Keller, Fraktalas Energy
 - Casey Lamont, Burlington Electric Department
 - Sam Lehr, Coalition for Renewable Natural Gas
 - Emily Levin, Northeast States Coordinated Air Use Management
 - Emily Roscoe, Efficiency Vermont
 - Floyd Vergara, Clean Fuels Alliance America
 - Rick Weston, Individual
 - Patrick Wood, Ag Methane Advisors
- Facilitator
 - Catherine Morris, Consensus Building Institute
- Participating Vermont Public Utility Commission staff
 - Deirdre Morris
 - Dominic Gatti
 - Tom Knauer

Welcome & Review of agenda [Time Stamp 0:00:00]

- Initiate recording

Review and approval of 3/7/24 and 3/21/24 meeting minutes [Time Stamp 0:01:50]

[Ken Jones moved to approve the 3/7/24 minutes. None opposed. Minutes approved at 9:36 am]

[TJ Poor moved to approve the 3/21/24 minutes. None opposed. Minutes approved at 9:37 am]

Updates from the PUC [Time Stamp 0:05:00]

- General updates
 - Revised PUC schedule
 - DDA selection timeline

TAG vacancy discussion [Time Stamp 0:16:00]

- What expertise is missing on the TAG?
- What is the process if the TAG supports filling the vacancy?

[Emily Levin moved to ask the PUC to fill the vacancy through the nomination process as before which listed a range of expertise that would be helpful. Luce Hillman seconded the motion. None opposed. The motion passed at 10:21 am]

DPS CHS Flow Chart [Time Stamp 0:49:30]

[Next Steps: If members have suggestions with how the flow chart can be improved, please email psd.cleanheat@vermont.gov. DPS has already received feedback that a swim lane for public engagement would be helpful.]

Equity Advisory Group Report [Time Stamp 1:04:40]

- Response to TAG request on low and middle income (LMI) definition
- Other updates

[Next steps: Emily Roscoe will be collaborating with Geoff Wilcox (EAG) on a memo responding to Ken Jones' LMI memo on programs that use self-attestation and those that don't. The memo will be informational and an EAG recommendation on the topic will follow at a later date.]

DPS Potential Study comments & responses [Time Stamp 1:07:40]

[Next Steps: If members have follow-up questions, please email psd.cleanheat@vermont.gov. NV5 to get back to TAG on how biomass and biogas fueled electricity will be treated in Potential Study.]

Break

Breakout groups [Time Stamp 1:35:30]

- Proposed initial breakout groups:
 - **Credit ownership:** “establish a standard methodology for determining what party or parties shall be the owner of a clean heat credit upon its creation. The owner or owners may transfer those credits to a third party or to an obligated party.” (Act 18 Sec. 8127 (b))
 - **Pacing:** recommendations on the process of setting and updating the 10-year schedule for the total number of credits to be retired each year. (Commission Order No. 23-2220-RULE)

- **Biofuels and biomass life cycle accounting:** “establish a schedule of lifecycle emission rates for heating fuels and any fuel that is used in a clean heat measure, including electricity, or is itself a clean heat measure, including biofuels.” (Act 18, Sec. 8127 (g))
- Initial roster and point person for breakouts; **call for additional volunteers**, if needed.
- What is the charge to each group today?
- General guidance for breakout groups
 - Identify the key questions that need to be answered (including concerns/questions raised in public comments)
 - Identify what the TAG can move on without consultant input
 - Identify the information that the TAG needs to answer these questions
 - Educate the TAG on the topic by circulating peer-reviewed research or recommending expert speakers
 - Review technical consultants’ assumptions / methodologies / results and identifying initial issues for TAG consideration
 - If possible, come to the TAG with straw proposals for further consideration
- Role of the public during breakout session

- Move to Breakouts

- Report back from breakout groups [**Time Stamp 1:56:38**]
 - Key questions to be answered and next steps

[Questions/notes raised by initial discussions in breakout groups:

Credit Ownership:

- *Who owns the credit and how does that change depending on whether it’s an energy product, service or fuel?*
- *How is a credit minted, transferred and retired?*
- *How to ensure there’s no double counting but also the flexibility for a credit to be divided in the event of multiple owners?*
- *Next steps: take comments from breakout members and collate the reactions/questions from those members. Review at next breakout session.*

Pacing:

- *Defining the reference year (are we using a range to set baseline emissions?)*
- *How does weather normalization factor into trajectory and/or credit obligations?*
- *Opportunity to focus on process now, data later*
- *Measure Mix (Consultant feedback, longer term topic)*
- *Lifecycle and meeting GWSA reductions – inherent tensions with statute*

DRAFT MINUTES

- *Review data sources (potential study, GHG inventory, historical thermal sector fuel usage) that will inform trajectory and individual obligations – what holes are there with fuel dealer registration data*
- *Next steps: start with DPS Pacing Straw Proposal Phase I*

Biofuels and biomass lifecycle accounting:

- *How does lifecycle accounting used in CHS overlap with state inventory?*
- *Wood waste accounting problem: How are details of carbon debt in cutting down trees accounted for? Are CO2 emissions from wood feedstocks treated as carbon neutral?*
- *What literature and policy examples inform the carbon neutral treatment of biogenic CO2?*
- *What literature and policy examples could inform the establishment of boundaries for carbon accounting (look at existing models)?*
- *Minnesota GREET thermal program – Is there time and budget for VT GREET model? If Minnesota modified GREET, can that model be used to modify with VT specific factors?*
- *How is the additionality or causality of all these fuels being handled?]*

Public Comments [Time Stamp 2:05:00]

Other Matters [Time Stamp 2:10:00]

- *Agenda topics for next meeting – Thurs., April 18, 9:30 – 12:30*

[Next steps: Will follow-up with breakout group point people to agenda set for next meeting.]

Close

[The group adjourned by unanimous consent at 12:24 pm]

Meeting recording:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=g87Jefd-sgY>

Breakout group recordings:

Credit ownership: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1_f4KdR4Ecc

Pacing: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xb6qOmrZFHw>

Biofuels and biomass lifecycle accounting: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6T9_EP11ebc